

NORTH DAKOTA REAL ESTATE APPRAISER QUALIFICATIONS AND ETHICS BOARD

Minutes – November 18, 2021 – 9:00AM CT Board Meeting

Chairperson Timian called the meeting to order at 9:02 AM. Roll call was taken.

Board Members present online: Chairperson Tim Timian, Corey Kost, Brock DesLauriers and Joe Sheehan

Staff Present: Jodie Campbell and David Campbell

Investigative Reviewer: Joe Ibach

Minutes: Board members reviewed the minutes of August 6 and August 31, 2021. Brock DesLauriers moved for approval of the minutes with corrections noted. Joe Sheehan seconded the motion. Chairman Timian called for the vote. Corey Kost, Brock DesLauriers and Tim Timian all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Educational Review: Carol Rowe submitted a report for review as part of the Board's educational review process. An independent review was completed. Discussion took place. Ms. Rowe was encouraged to utilize the review, as well as additional Board member and Board Reviewer comments, when completing future reports. Brock DesLauriers moved to allow Ms. Rowe's report to be used as one of three reports for future licensure. Corey Kost seconded the motion. Discussion took place. Chairman Timian called for the vote. Brock DesLauriers, Joe Sheehan, Corey Kost and Tim Timian voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Applicants:

Jared Miller's application for licensure was tabled at the meeting of 8/31/2021, and the Board requested he revise and re-submit one report for independent review. Mr. Miller complied with the Board's request, and the report has been reviewed by Board Reviewer, Joe Ibach. Mr. Miller is online for discussion.

Discussion took place. Review of the report indicates compliance with the minimum standards set forth in USPAP for licensure. Corey Kost moved to approve Jared Miller for licensure. Brock DesLauriers seconded the motion. Chairman Timian called for the vote. Brock DesLauriers, Joe Sheehan, Corey Kost and Tim Timian all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

David Whartnaby is making application for certified general and was online discussion. Review of Mr. Whartnaby's application indicates he has met the education, examination, and experience hour requirements for certified general.

Mr. Whartnaby had submitted a report for educational review and the report was approved for upgrade. Two additional reports were selected and reviewed by the Board Reviewer. Discussion took place. Review of the reports indicates compliance with the minimum standards set forth in USPAP for certified general. Corey Kost moved to approve David Whartnaby for certified general. Brock DesLauriers seconded the motion. Chairman Timian called for the vote. Brock DesLauriers, Joe Sheehan, Corey Kost and Tim Timian all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Jason Austad is making application for certified residential and was online for discussion. Review of Mr. Austad's application indicates Mr. Austad has met the education, examination, and experience hour requirements for certified residential. Reports were selected and submitted for review by Board Reviewer, Joe Ibach.

The reviews indicated numerous areas of noncompliance. Board members discussed a number of the issues: 1) improper use of extraordinary assumption (must be assignment specific), 2) Reviewer could not find information to replicate the cost approach (requirement of Fannie Mae), 3) minimal direct market support for adjustments, 4) failed to compare and reconcile the four units of comparison, 5) sales appeared to lack personal verification, 6) reconciliation of data did not provide the rationale as to why the value was selected, 7) market rents lacked support and 8) inappropriate use of GRM.

Mr. Austad went through the education review process. The Reviewer and Board members found little improvement from the issues noted in the educational review. Board members strongly encouraged Mr. Austad to utilize the

reviews as a guide to assist in improving future work product to meet minimum standards.

Based on the issues noted in the reviews, as well as addition Board Reviewer and Board member comments, Corey Kost moved to table Jason Austad's application for certified residential. Within a minimum 6 month, to a maximum 12-month timeframe, Mr. Austad must complete 1) a minimum 7-hour course relating to the "Income Approach for Residential Appraisers" and 2) a minimum 4-hour course relating to "Thinking Outside the Form". In addition, Mr. Austad must revise and resubmit the two reports reviewed (one report must be of the income producing property). The reports will be forwarded to the Board Reviewer review. Chairman Timian called for the vote. Joe Sheehan, Brock DesLauriers, Corey Kost and Tim Timian all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Apprentice Permits and Permits issued via Reciprocity-Require Board Confirmation: The following applicants were issued permits based on meeting the requirements for their respective levels. Board confirmation is required:

- Certified General: Samuel C. Brown (via reciprocity with WA)
Alden Katagihara (via reciprocity with CA)
Dennis S. Miller (via reciprocity with UT)
Ted R. Whitmer (via reciprocity with TX)
Dennis Williamson (via reciprocity with MO)
- Certified Residential: Susan E. Alley (via reciprocity with MO)
- Apprentice: Kassandra M. Gorder (Roger Cymbaluk, Supervisor)
Diane E. Kenney (Dennis Huber, Supervisor)
Katherine M. Moore (Bill Triebwasser & Eric Grande, Supervisors)
Bryce W. Neubert (Nathan Hansen, Supervisor)
Jaime P. Pollert (Dennis Huber, Supervisor)
Alyssa R. Schockman (Roger Cymbaluk, Supervisor)

Brock DesLauriers moved to confirm all applicants for their respective levels. Corey Kost seconded the motion. Chairman Timian called for the vote. Joe Sheehan, Corey Kost, Brock DesLauriers, and Tim Timian all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Rachel Denton has made application for renewal. Ms. Denton provided documentation of disciplinary action taken against her by the state of Oklahoma. Ms. Denton met the terms of the Consent Order. Corey Kost moved to approve Ms. Denton's application for renewal. Brock DesLauriers seconded the motion. Chairman Timian called for the vote. Joe Sheehan, Corey Kost, Brock DesLauriers, and Tim Timian all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Chairman Timian called for adjournment. The Board meeting adjourned at 10:21AM.

Respectfully submitted,

Jodie R. Campbell
Executive Secretary