Chairperson Ibach called the meeting to order. Roll call was taken.

Board Members present: Chairperson Joseph Ibach        Tim Timian
                        Kathy Maier            David Lanpher
Staff Present:         Jodie Campbell
Others Present:        Eric Zink                        Nancy Willis, ND Assoc. of Realtors
                        Beth Keller           Brian Bennett, GL Solutions

Applicants:
Eric Zink is making application for licensure and was online for discussion. Review of Mr. Zink’s application indicates he meets the education, experience hours and examination requirements for licensure. Reports were reviewed for compliance with USPAP. Numerous deficiencies were noted indicating noncompliance with USPAP. Board members discussed the reviews with Mr. Zinc. Some of the deficiencies discussed included: 1) lack of support for site value; 2) “As is” value of site improvements left blank; 3) highest and best use not summarized; 4) lack of analysis of prior sales history; 5) comments are not assignment specific/overuse of boilerplate language; 6) concerns with special assessments; 7) the appraiser’s understanding of exposure time versus marketing time; 8) lack of development of work file; 9) although the appraiser is noted in the reports as providing significant assistance—no detail was provided as to what the appraiser did in the assignment; 10) lack of support and comment throughout approaches; 11) geographic competency; and 12) lack of reconciliation to understand value conclusion.

Based on review of work product and discussion with Mr. Zink, Dave Lanpher moved to table Eric Zink’s application for licensure and request Mr. Zinc submit two additional reports for formal review. Mr. Zinc is to submit a current log of appraisals from which two reports will be selected. Tim Timian seconded the motion. Dave Lanpher, Tim Timian, Kathy Maier and Joe Ibach all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Supervisory appraiser: Eric Zink was noted in all three reports as providing significant assistance, with Aaron Abaurrea signing all three reports. Review of the reports indicates the reports do not meet the minimum standards of USPAP.

Tim Timian moved to initiate a complaint on Aaron Abaurrea based on the fact that there is reasonable basis to believe the reports submitted by Eric Zink and signed by Aaron Abaurrea did not the minimum Standards of USPAP. Kathy Maier seconded the motion. Dave Lanpher, Tim Timian, Kathy Maier and Joe Ibach all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Staff is to forward a letter to Mr. Abaurrea requesting a response to the reviews.

Applicants Requiring Board Review: Josh Allison is making application for certified general via reciprocity with Texas. Board members reviewed Mr. Allison’s application. Kathy Maier moved to approve Josh Allison for certified general. Tim Timian seconded the motion. Tim Timian, Kathy Maier, Dave Lanpher and Joe Ibach all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Jane Lavalla is making application for certified residential via reciprocity with Minnesota. Board members reviewed Ms. Lavalla’s application. Dave Lanpher moved to approve Jane Lavalla for certified residential. Tim Timian seconded the motion. Tim Timian, Kathy Maier, Dave Lanpher and Joe Ibach all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Permits Issued/Require Board approval: Staff reviewed, approved and issued permits to the following applicants:
Apprentice:
Robert Dees
Certified Residential:
David B. Fife (via reciprocity with UT)
Ruth S. Mahan (via reciprocity with MN)
Certified General:
Daniel T. Boris (via reciprocity with MN)
Jonathon M. Fletcher (via reciprocity with CO)
Sandra L. Gresh (via reciprocity with SD)
Tony M. Jenkins (via reciprocity with GA)
Frank N. McLean (via reciprocity with MN)  
Tyler M. Pooley (via reciprocity with ID)

Dave Lanpher moved to affirm the applicants for their respective levels. Tim Timian seconded the motion. Tim Timian, Kathy Maier, Dave Lanpher and Joe Ibach all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

**Educational Review:**
Gretta Pollard provided a work product for educational review. Ms. Pollard has not had the opportunity to review the educational review. Discussion is tabled until a following meeting.

**Finances:**
Brian Bennett with GL Solutions has submitted a proposal to develop an online database system/application process for the ND Appraiser Board. Mr. Bennett provided an overview of GL’s proposal and fielded questions from the Board and Staff. No decision was made.

Board members reviewed the Revised Proposed Budget submitted by Staff. Dave Lanpher moved to approve the Budget as proposed. Kathy Maier seconded the motion. Tim Timian, Kathy Maier, Dave Lanpher and Joe Ibach all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

**Education:** The following educational offerings have been submitted for Board approval:

**ASFMRA:**
- ASFMRA 85th Annual Convention Day 1 (7 hrs CE)  
- ASFMRA 85th Annual Convention Day 2 (3.5 hrs CE)  
- Rapid Fire Case Studies (7 hrs CE)

**Alterra Group:**
- A Practical Guide to Appraisal Review (7 hrs CE)

**Appraisal Institute:**
- General Appraiser Income Approach Part II (27 hrs + 3 hr exam QE)  
- Residential Market Analysis & Highest & Best Use (14 hrs CE)  
- Unraveling the Mystery of Fannie Mae Appraisal Guidelines (4 hrs CE-Synchronous)

**McKissock:**
- Appraisal of Fast Food Facilities (7 hrs CE)

Tim Timian moved to approve the above listed education for their respective hours, as appraisal specific. Dave Lanpher seconded the motion. Tim Timian, Kathy Maier, Dave Lanpher and Joe Ibach all voted yes to the motion. The vote was unanimous. Motion carried.

Chairperson Ibach called for adjournment.

Respectfully submitted,

Jodie R. Campbell, Executive Secretary